

#### MEETING OF THE AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

#### THURSDAY 9TH MARCH 2023 AT 6.00 P.M.

#### PARKSIDE SUITE - PARKSIDE

MEMBERS: Councillors S. R. Colella (Chairman), A. D. Kriss (Vice-

Chairman), A. J. B. Beaumont, R. E. Jenkins, J. E. King,

L. C. R. Mallett, M. Middleton, C. J. Spencer and

P. J. Whittaker

#### **AGENDA**

- 1. Apologies for Absence and Named Substitutes
- 2. Declarations of Interest and Whipping Arrangements

To invite Councillors to declare any Disclosable Pecuniary interests or Other Disclosable Interests they may have in items on the agenda, and to confirm the nature of those interests.

- 3. To confirm the accuracy of the minutes of the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee meeting held on 19th January 2023 (Pages 7 14)
- 4. Standards Regime Monitoring Officers' Report (Pages 15 18)
- 5. Audit Task Group Final Report for the Root and Branch Review of how the Council arrived at the Section 24 Notice (to follow)
- 6. Statement of Accounts Verbal Update

- 7. Internal Audit Progress Report (Pages 19 48)
- 8. Audit, Standards and Governance Committee Annual Report 2022-23 (to follow)
- 9. **Risk Champion Verbal Update Report** (Councillor M. Middleton)
- 10. Audit, Standards and Governance Committee Work Programme (Pages 49 50)

K. DICKS Chief Executive

Parkside Market Street BROMSGROVE Worcestershire B61 8DA

1st March 2023

# If you have any queries on this Agenda please contact Mateusz Sliwinski

Parkside, Market Street, Bromsgrove, B61 8DA Tel: (01527) 64252 Ext: 3095

Emal: mateusz.sliwinski@bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk

# GUIDANCE ON FACE-TO-FACE <u>MEETINGS</u>

At the current time, seating at the meeting will be placed in such a way as to achieve as much space as possible for social distancing to help protect meeting participants.

If you have any questions regarding the agenda or attached papers, please do not hesitate to contact the officer named above.

# GUIDANCE FOR ELECTED MEMBERS ATTENDING MEETINGS IN PERSON

Members and Officers who still have access to lateral flow tests (LFTs) are encouraged to take a test on the day of the meeting. Meeting attendees who do not have access to LFTs are encouraged not to attend a Committee if they have if they have common cold symptoms or any of the following common symptoms of Covid-19 on the day of the meeting; a high temperature, a new and continuous cough or a loss of smell and / or taste.

The meeting venue will be fully ventilated, and Members and officers may need to consider wearing appropriate clothing in order to remain comfortable during proceedings.

#### **PUBLIC ATTENDANCE AT MEETINGS**

Members of the public will be able to access the meeting if they wish to do so. Seating will be placed in such a way as to achieve as much space as possible for social distancing to help protect meeting participants. It should be noted that members of the public who choose to attend in person do so at their own risk.

Members of the public who still have access to lateral flow tests (LFTs) are encouraged to take a test on the day of the meeting. Meeting attendees who do not have access to LFTs are encouraged not to attend a Committee if they have any of the following common symptoms of Covid-19 on the day of the meeting; a high temperature, a new and continuous cough or a loss of smell and / or taste.

#### Notes:

Although this is a public meeting, there are circumstances when Council might have to move into closed session to consider exempt or confidential information. For agenda items that are exempt, the public are excluded and for any such items.



#### **INFORMATION FOR THE PUBLIC**

#### **Access to Information**

The Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 widened the rights of press and public to attend Local Authority meetings and to see certain documents. Recently the Freedom of Information Act 2000 has further broadened these rights, and limited exemptions under the 1985 Act.

- You can inspect agenda and public reports at least five days before the date of the meeting.
- ➤ You can inspect minutes of the Council, Cabinet and its Committees/Boards for up to six years following a meeting.
- ➤ You can have access, upon request, to the background papers on which reports are based for a period of up to six years from the date of the meeting. These are listed at the end of each report.
- An electronic register stating the names and addresses and electoral areas of all Councillors with details of the membership of all Committees etc. is available on our website.
- A reasonable number of copies of agendas and reports relating to items to be considered in public will be made available to the public attending meetings of the Council, Cabinet and its Committees/Boards.
- You have access to a list specifying those powers which the Council has delegated to its Officers indicating also the titles of the Officers concerned, as detailed in the Council's Constitution, Scheme of Delegation.

You can access the following documents:

- Meeting Agendas
- Meeting Minutes
- ➤ The Council's Constitution

at www.bromsgrove.gov.uk



Audit, Standards and Governance Committee

19th January 2023

#### BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

# MEETING OF THE AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE 19TH JANUARY 2023, AT 6.00 P.M.

PRESENT: Councillors A. D. Kriss (Vice-Chairman), A. J. B. Beaumont,

R. E. Jenkins, J. E. King, M. Middleton, J. Till, P. J. Whittaker and

B. McEldowney (Parish Councils' Representative)

Observers: Councillor G. Denaro (Portfolio Holder for Ms. K. Lees – Grant Thornton (on Microsoft Teams)

Officers: Mr P. Carpenter, Mrs. C. Felton, Ms M. Howell and

Mr. A. Bromage (on Microsoft Teams), Mrs. J. Bayley-Hill, and Mr.

M. Sliwinski.

# 41/22 <u>ELECTION OF CHAIRMAN OF THE AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE FOR THE REMAINDER OF THE MUNICIPAL YEAR 2022-23</u>

Nominations were requested for the position of the Chairman of the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee for the remainder of the municipal year 2022-23.

A nomination was received in respect of Councillor S. Colella and on being put to the vote it was

**RESOLVED** that Councillor S. Colella be appointed as the Chairman of the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee for the remainder of the 2022-23 municipal year and that as Councillor S. Colella had submitted his apologies for this meeting, the Vice-Chairman, Councillor A. Kriss, assume the Chair for this meeting.

#### 42/22 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE AND NAMED SUBSTITUTES

Apologies for absence were received from Councillors S. Colella, L. Mallett and C. Spencer.

Councillor J. Till attended the meeting as a named substitute for Councillor C. Spencer.

Apologies were also submitted on behalf of the Leader of the Council, Councillor K. May, who was due to attend as an observer.

#### 43/22 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST AND WHIPPING ARRANGEMENTS**

## Audit, Standards and Governance Committee 19th January 2023

There were no Declarations of Interest nor of any Whipping Arrangements.

# 44/22 TO CONFIRM THE ACCURACY OF THE MINUTES OF THE AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE MEETING HELD ON 14TH DECEMBER 2022

The minutes of the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee held on 14<sup>th</sup> December 2022 were submitted.

**RESOLVED** that the minutes of the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee held on 14<sup>th</sup> December 2022 be approved as a correct record.

#### 45/22 **ELECTION OF A RISK CHAMPION**

Members were advised that a role description that had been requested for the role of a Risk Champion could be found in the appendix to the main report.

Nominations were requested for the position of a Risk Champion for the remainder of the municipal year 2022-23.

A nomination was submitted in respect of Councillor M. Middleton and on being put to the vote it was

<u>RESOLVED</u> that Councillor M. Middleton be appointed as the Risk Champion for the remainder of the municipal year 2022-23.

#### 46/22 STANDARDS REGIME - MONITORING OFFICER'S REPORT

The Head of Legal, Democratic and Property Services Property Services presented the Monitoring Officer's report and in doing so highlighted that there had been training delivered to Members on the Elections Act 2022. It was also highlighted that since the last meeting there had been a number of complaints made to the Monitoring Officer by Parish Councillors regarding matters that related to the Parish Councils. It was noted that these were most appropriately dealt with by Parish Councils and not by a District Council's Monitoring Officer.

It was reported that, regarding complaints received concerning District Council Members, there was one outstanding complaint which remained live as of this meeting.

Following the update, the Committee discussed the issue of poor attendance at recent Code of Conduct and other training sessions for Members. It was reiterated that attendance by Members at training sessions was imperative for ensuring good governance of the Council and would likely be raised looked in the upcoming peer review of the Council.

Audit, Standards and Governance Committee

19th January 2023

**RESOLVED** that the Monitoring Officer's Report be noted.

# 47/22 ROOT AND BRANCH REVIEW OF HOW THE COUNCIL ARRIVED AT THE SECTION 24 NOTICE

The Committee considered the arrangements for the proposed Audit Task Group to enable the root and branch investigation of how the Council arrived at section 24 notice to proceed.

The Interim Director of Finance stated that an LGA peer review of the Council was due to begin on 6<sup>th</sup> March 2023 and it was deemed imperative that the root and branch investigation was concluded before this date. It was added that once arrangements were agreed at tonight's meeting, Members chosen to sit on the Task Group would be provided with a starting set of documentation such as Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP) Board minutes.

The dates for the meetings of the Audit Task Group were proposed as follows:

- 2<sup>nd</sup> February to review the documentation provided and to decide the witnesses to be interviewed
- 20<sup>th</sup> or 21<sup>st</sup> February (or both dates) to undertake interviews with the witnesses
- 28<sup>th</sup> February or 1<sup>st</sup> March (or both) to prepare and finalise a set of recommendations.

It was advised that the membership of the Audit Task Group be restricted to the Members of the 'parent' Audit, Standards and Governance Committee.

#### **RESOLVED**

- 1) that the Audit Task Group be established to undertake the root and branch investigation of how the Council arrived at a section 24 notice:
- 2) that Councillor S. Colella be appointed as Chairman of the Audit Task Group and that the Vice-Chairman be appointed at the first meeting of the Task Group.
- 3) that the membership of the Audit Task Group be comprised of Councillors S. Colella (Chairman), A. Beaumont, J. King, A. Kriss, M. Middleton, and P. Whittaker.
- 4) that the terms of reference for the Audit Task Group, attached at Appendix 1, be approved.
- 5) that the indicative date for completion of the root and branch investigation be the beginning of March 2023.

#### 48/22 <u>VERBAL UPDATE ON SUBMISSION OF STATEMENT OF ACCOUNTS</u>

Audit, Standards and Governance Committee 19th January 2023

#### 2020-21

The Head of Finance and Customer Service reported that the amount of items and total amounts held in the suspense account had decreased significantly since this was reported at the last meeting. The amount held in suspense had decreased from £3.190m (representing 500 lines of items) to £52k (and representing approximately 150 items).

Following this update, it was reported that as the amounts to allocate from suspense accounts got smaller it was correspondingly more difficult to establish where transactions should be allocated. It was noted, however, that now the finance team had managed to reduce the amount in suspense to only £50k, the focus had to be on the task of 2021-22 Accounts, as during the whole of that financial year the Council experienced issues with cash receipting. The External Auditor commented that £52k in suspense was considered non-material compared to the previous and that this should therefore mean no qualification would be issued to the 2020-21 Accounts.

It was reported that the indicative timeline for the issuance of opinion on 2020-21 Statement of Accounts was July 2023 or later, with 2021-22 Accounts not expected to have opinion issued before the end of 2022-23 financial year, and the delivery of 2022-23 Accounts expected before the end of 2023-24 financial year by which time the Council should be up-to-date with the auditing of financial statements.

In response to questions from Members, it was noted that the Section 24 issued to the Council would lapse once the 2020-21 Statement of Accounts had been signed-off by the Auditors. It was deemed highly unlikely that the Council could receive another Section 24 notice relating to 2021-22 Accounts as the issues underlying the delays for both these sets of Accounts were the same.

In response to a Member question concerning whether Grant Thornton prioritised auditing accounts for some organisations over others, it was noted that at the start of year the external auditors profiled all the audits to be completed for the year and no priority was given to any one organisation. There were set time periods within the year set aside for health sector (NHS) accounts, which was April to June for auditing accounts of NHS entities.

#### 49/22 INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT

The Committee received the Internal Audit Progress Report from the Head of Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service. The report before the Committee summarised progress made against the delivery of the Internal Audit Plan 2022/23 as of end of December 2022. It was noted that Appendix 2 provided a complete overview of the plan and a holistic view of the progress against the plan.

Audit, Standards and Governance Committee
19th January 2023

The Head of Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service reported that two data sets were to be uploaded to central database as part of the National Fraud Initiative (NFI) matching exercise in January 2023, concerning Council Tax Single Person Discount and Electoral Registration. It was noted there were no exceptions to report in terms of fraud or other serious risk.

The Head of Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service reported that the main internal audit report before the Committee concerned monitoring of the Council's fleet and plant fuel usage and efficiency and other internal audit reports were now nearing completion. Three follow-up reports had also been submitted following the Committee's request for follow-up internal audit reviews in these areas.

Officers provided an update on the assurance status of items on the internal audit follow up programme and reported that Council fleet fuel usage remained the only area of moderate internal assurance.

Following the update, Members expressed concern about the summary of delivery against the internal audit plan as it was noted that only 98 days of audit had been delivered against the annual target of 230 days (as at 31st December 2022) and that the current target for this financial year was therefore impossible to fulfil. Officers explained that depending on investigations and in-depth reviews and audits that had to be undertaken the annual target was subject to change in days, and that of much more importance to the effectiveness of internal audit function was the coverage of internal audit across all areas of council business and not the actual budgeted days spent. It was also explained that 'day' targets were also indicative and there was a variation allowed to account for different priorities year-on-year.

Members sought assurance that all Council vehicles were appropriately taxed and had an up-to-date MOT. Officers assured Members that this was the case and also noted that the appropriate head of service would be approached to provide a full response to Members on this matter. It was also reported that the issue of accounting for all key fobs for council vehicles would also be raised with the appropriate head of service.

It was reported that it was likely that cyber security insurance would not be available to local authorities after the end of this financial year due as insurers were withdrawing this option due to high risk. Bromsgrove Council was covered by cyber security insurance until June 2024. This was a great risk to local authorities, especially with a number of councils recently hit by cyber security attacks. It was therefore imperative that the Local Government Association (LGA) was lobbied on this matter to ensure that a 'self-insurance' option was available in the sector in the absence of private insurance provision.

Officers noted that District Councils would not normally offer support to Parish Councils on cyber security as these were separate entities

## Audit, Standards and Governance Committee 19th January 2023

operating on different types of IT systems and with different requirements.

Members requested that information about the current cost of the Council's cyber security insurance be provided at the next meeting of the Committee.

**RESOLVED** that the report be noted.

#### 50/22 FINANCIAL SAVINGS MONITORING REPORT

The Interim Director of Finance presented this report and reported that £428k of non-allocated savings and efficiency targets from previous years had now been allocated as shown in the report.

It was reported that in-year overspend position at Q2 only stood at £342k, and this overspend position needed to be adjusted for the effect of the staff pay award paid in December 2022 which an overall effect of increasing cost in year by another £720k. In addition, £411k of reserves were already utilised to support the budget as part of the 2022-23 Medium Term Financial Plan (MTFP). Therefore, the 2022-23 in year overspend position of the Council stood at £1.472m, which would reduce General Fund Reserves from opening position of £4.485m to £3.013m.

It was reported that the £342k overspend in Q2 was mainly due to the overspend in Facilities Management / SLM of £408k. This was as the Council had a contract with SLM for delivery of Leisure Management Services on behalf of the Council. It was noted that the leisure sector continued to recover from the effects of Covid-19 pandemic and it was prudent to assume an in-year pressure in this area.

In terms of arrangements, it was noted that the Council operated open book accounting with SLM where key financial information was shared. It was noted that leisure centres also contributed to reducing costs by keeping costs of the NHS down.

Following the presentation, the following answers were provided to Members' queries:

- With regards to Artrix it was noted that it was operated by a Trust while the Council was a separated entity. The Council worked with Artrix to find funding streams.
- It was noted that the high vacancy rates and agency staff cover were common issues across the local authority sector and the Council planned to implement initiatives to recruit and retain younger staff such as creating career graded posts with training for the job provided and utilising the apprenticeship levy for graduate recruitment.

#### **RESOLVED** that

### Audit, Standards and Governance Committee 19th January 2023

- 1) Progress on 2022/23 Departmental Savings be noted.
- 2) Progress on Efficiency Savings be reported back to the Committee following allocations part of Quarter 2 2022/23 monitoring.
- 3) Present Council overspend position for 2022-23 and actions to mitigate this be noted.

#### 51/22 RISK REPORT

The Committee considered the Quarterly Risk Update and it was noted that this was the third risk update to the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee since no assurance had been provided in June 2021 following an Internal Audit Review of Risk Management Strategies.

It was noted that the Council now had an agreed definition of a Corporate Risk and the Officer Risk Board had an agreed definition with regards to when Departmental Risks should be raised to Corporate Risks and, conversely, when Corporate Risks should be reduced to Departmental Risks.

The number of departmental risks had continually reduced in the last 9 months, down to 55 as at the end of December 2022, and these included two red departmental risks, relating to robustness of the revenues performance indicator data and the Bromsgrove Leisure contracts. There were twenty-one amber risks.

It was reported that monitoring of mould/damp issues in private sector properties was a significant issue that was deemed to warrant inclusion as a separate risk, and Officers also noted that cost of living would also be included as a separate risk item.

#### **RESOLVED** that

the present list of Corporate and Departmental Risks be noted and additional risk requests considered.

# 52/22 <u>AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE WORK</u> <u>PROGRAMME</u>

The Committee noted that the Audit Task Group would be launched with meetings taking place over February 2022 as agreed under Minute Item No. 47/22 – Root and Branch Review of how the Council arrived at the Section 24 Notice.

The meeting closed at 8.10 p.m.

# Agenda Item 3 Audit, Standards and Governance Committee 19th January 2023

**Chairman** 

# Audit, Standards & Governance Committee 2023

9th March

#### **MONITORING OFFICER'S REPORT**

Relevant Portfolio Holder		Councillor Geoff Denaro – Portfolio Holder for Finance and Governance		
Portfolio Holder Consulted		Yes		
Relevant Head of Service		Yes		
Report Author	Job Title:	Head of Legal, Democratic and		
Claire Felton	Property S	Services		
	Contact e	email:		
	c.felton@	bromsgroveandredditch.gov.uk		
Wards Affected		N/A		
Ward Councillor(s) consulted	d	N/A		
Relevant Strategic Purpose(s)		An Effective and Sustainable Council		
Non-Key Decision				
If you have any questions at	out this re	port, please contact the report author in		
advance of the meeting.	·	•		
aaranoo or alo illoomig.				

#### 1. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

The Audit, Standards and Governance Committee is asked to RESOLVE that:-

1) subject to Members' comments, the report be noted

#### 2. BACKGROUND

- 2.1 This report sets out the position in relation to key standards regime matters which are of relevance to the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee since the last update provided at the ordinary meeting of the Committee in January 2023.
- 2.2 It has been proposed that a report of this nature be presented to each meeting of the Committee to ensure that Members are kept updated with any relevant standards matters.
- 2.3 Any further updates arising after publication of this report, including any relevant standards issues raised by Parish Councils, will be reported verbally by Officers at the meeting.

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

# Audit, Standards & Governance Committee 2023

9th March

#### 3. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

3.1 There are no financial implications arising out of this report.

#### 4. **LEGAL IMPLICATIONS**

4.1 Chapter 7 of Part 1 of the Localism Act 2011 ('the Act') places a requirement on authorities to promote and maintain high standards of conduct by Members and co-opted (with voting rights) Members of an authority. The Act also requires the authority to have in place arrangements under which allegations that either a district or parish councillor has breached his or her Code of Conduct can be investigated, together with arrangements under which decisions on such allegations can be made.

#### 5. STRATEGIC PURPOSES - IMPLICATIONS

#### **Relevant Strategic Purpose**

5.1 It is important to ensure that the Council manages standards regime matters in an appropriate manner. The issues detailed in this report help to ensure that there is an effective and sustainable Council.

#### **Climate Change Implications**

5.2 There are no specific climate change implications

#### 6. OTHER IMPLICATIONS

#### **Equalities and Diversity Implications**

6.1 There are no direct implications arising out of this report. Details of the Council's arrangements for managing standards complaints under the Localism Act 2011 are available on the Council's website and from the Monitoring Officer on request.

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

# Audit, Standards & Governance Committee 2023

9th March

#### **Operational Implications**

#### 6.2 Member Complaints

Since the last meeting of the Committee the Monitoring Officer has received one complaint from a member of the public in relation to District Councillors and this has been managed through the local resolution process.

In respect of the complaint reported at the last meeting of the Committee, the matter remains ongoing and is now with the subject member and advisor for comment and resolution. Members are further advised that all non-code related matters reported to the Monitoring Officer historically have been assessed and included in the training sessions for District members pre and post-election.

#### **Constitution Review**

6.3 The Constitution Review Working Group met on 26<sup>th</sup> January 2023. The outcomes of this meeting will be reported to the Annual Council meeting in May 2023.

#### Member Development

The Member Development Steering Group continues to meet regularly. The most recent meeting of the group was held on 8<sup>th</sup> March 2023. During the meeting the group considered final arrangements for the induction of Councillors due to be elected in May 2023.

#### Member Training

- 6.5 Since the last meeting of the Committee the following training has been arranged for Members:
  - Emergency planning training

#### 7. RISK MANAGEMENT

7.1 The main risks associated with the details included in this report are:

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

# Audit, Standards & Governance Committee 2023

9th March

- Risk of challenge to Council decisions; and
- Risk of complaints about elected Members.

#### 8. <u>APPENDICES and BACKGROUND PAPERS</u>

No appendices.

Chapter 7 of the Localism Act 2011.

#### 9. REPORT SIGN OFF

Department	Name and Job Title	Date
Portfolio Holder	Councillor Geoff Denaro – Portfolio Holder for Governance	20 <sup>th</sup> February 2023
Lead Director / Head of Service	Claire Felton - Head of Legal, Equalities and Democratic Services and Monitoring Officer	20 <sup>th</sup> February 2023
Financial Services	N/A	
Legal Services	Claire Felton - Head of Legal, Equalities and Democratic Services and Monitoring Officer	20 <sup>th</sup> February 2023

Date: 9th March 2023

#### **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

#### THE INTERNAL AUDIT PROGRESS REPORT

Relevant Portfolio Holder		Councillor Geoff Denaro				
Portfolio Holder Consulted		Yes				
Relevant Head of Service		Peter Carpenter, s151 Officer				
Report Author	Job Title:	Head of Internal Audit Shared Service				
	Worceste	ershire Internal Audit Shared Service				
	Contact e	mail: andy.bromage@worcester.gov.uk				
	Contact T	el: 01905 722051				
Wards Affected		All Wards				
Ward Councillor(s) consulted	d	No				
Relevant Strategic Purpose(	(s)	Good Governance & Risk				
		Management underpins all the				
		Strategic Purposes.				
Non-Key Decision						
If you have any questions at	out this re	port, please contact the report author in				
advance of the meeting.						

#### 1. **RECOMMENDATIONS**

The Audit, Standards and Governance Committee recommend:-

1) the report is noted.

#### 2. BACKGROUND

The involvement of Member's in progress monitoring is considered an important facet of good corporate governance, contributing to the internal control assurance given in the Council's Annual Governance Statement.

This section of the report provides commentary on Internal Audit's performance for the period 01<sup>st</sup> April 2022 to 31<sup>st</sup> January 2023.

#### Summary Dashboard 2022/23:

Summary Dashboard 2022/23:		
Total reviews planned for 2022/23	mum)	
Reviews finalised to date for 2022/23:	LADS2 Grants)	
Assurance of 'moderate' or below:	3	
Reviews awaiting final sign off:	1	
Reviews ongoing: 9		
Reviews to commence (Q4):	0	
'High' Priority recommendations reported 20	0	
Satisfied 'High' priority recommendations to	N/a	
Plan delivery to January 2023:	59%	

Since the last progress report presented to the Committee, two reports have been finalised, one report is at clearance/draft report stage and nine reviews are ongoing.

Date: 9th March 2023

#### **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

Follow Up outcomes are reported in Appendices 4 and 5 and by exception.

All 'limited' or below assurance reviews go before Corporate Management Team for full consideration.

#### 2022/23 AUDITS TAKING PLACE AS AT 31st JANUARY 2023

A rolling programme of testing has taken place during quarters 1 to 3 for Debtors, Creditors and Payroll. The results will be reported during quarter 4.

The reviews that have been finalised since the last committee update:

- Debtors
- Main Ledger

The review at draft report or clearance stage is:

Workshop Licensing Compliance

Reviews currently being undertaken and at planning and testing stages include:

- Transformation Team Utilisation
- Creditors
- Treasury Management
- Council tax
- National Non-Domestic Rates
- Benefits
- Risk Management
- ICT
- Worcester Regulatory Services

As the above are classified as 'on going' the assurance and outcome of the reviews will be reported at Committee on completion.

Critical review audits are designed to add value to an evolving Service area. Depending on the transformation that a Service is experiencing at the time of a scheduled review a decision is made regarding the audit approach. Where there is significant change taking place due to transformation, restructuring, significant legislative updates or a comparison required a critical review approach will be used. To assist the service area to move forwards challenge areas will be identified using audit review techniques. The percentage of critical reviews will be confirmed as part of the overall outturn figure for the audit programme. The outturn from the reviews will be reported in summary format as part of the regular reporting.

Date: 9th March 2023

#### **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

Internal Audit are continuing to consider new processes emerging from the ongoing changing working arrangements that have been necessary to continue to provide Bromsgrove residents with services post pandemic. Plan flexibility is continuing to be required to include and provide assurance on potential areas of change.

Follow up reviews are an integral part of the audit process. There is a rolling programme of review that is undertaken to ensure that there is progress with the implementation of the agreed action plans (Appendix 4). The outcomes of the follow up reviews are reported in full (Appendix 5) so the general direction of travel and the risk exposure can be considered by Committee. An escalation process involving CMT and SMT is in place to ensure more effective use of resource regarding follow up to reduce the number of revisits necessary to confirm the recommendations have been satisfied.

#### 3.4 AUDIT DAYS

Appendix 1 provides a summary of delivery. At the 31<sup>st</sup> January 2023 a total of 109 days had been delivered against an overall target of 185 days for the year.

Appendix 2 shows the indicative plan for the year and the progress made to deliver it.

Appendix 3 provides copies of the reports that have been completed and final reports for 2022/23 issued since the previous progress report presented to Committee.

Appendix 4 provides a summary overview of the follow up programme.

Appendix 5 provides copies of the completed Follow Up Reports.

#### 3.5 OTHER KEY AUDIT WORK

Much internal audit work is carried out "behind the scenes" but is not always the subject of a formal report. Productive audit time is accurately recorded against the service or function as appropriate. Examples include:

- Governance for example assisting with the Annual Government Statement
- Risk management
- Transformation review providing support as a 'critical appraisal'
- Dissemination of information regarding potential fraud cases likely to affect the Council
- Drawing managers' attention to specific audit or risk issues
- Audit advice and commentary
- Internal audit recommendations: follow up review to analyse progress

Date: 9th March 2023

#### **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

- Day to day audit support and advice for example control implications, etc.
- Networking with audit colleagues in other Councils on professional points of practice
- National Fraud Initiative coordination of uploads.
- Investigations

#### **National Fraud Initiative**

3.6 National Fraud Initiative data set uploads were completed by the end of November 2022 and January 2023. The results from those matches are now being received and the various Service areas will work through them and take appropriate action. WIASS continue to provide advice and assistance regarding the process.

#### **Monitoring**

3.7 To ensure the delivery of the 2022/23 plan and any revision required there continues to be close and continual monitoring of the plan delivery, forecasted requirements of resource – v – actual delivery, and where necessary, additional resource will be secured to assist with the overall Service demands. The Head of Internal Audit Shared Service remains confident his team will be able to provide the required coverage for the year to ensure an internal audit opinion can be reached using reviews from the authority's core financial systems, as well as other systems which have taken place. Changes to the plan will be discussed with the s151 Officer and reported to Committee.

#### 4. FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

4.1 There are no direct financial implications arising out of this report.

#### 5. LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

5.1 The Council is required under Regulation 6 of the Accounts and Audit Regulations 2018 to "maintain in accordance with proper practices an adequate and effective system of internal audit of its accounting records and of its system of internal control".

#### 6. STRATEGIC PURPOSES - IMPLICATIONS

#### **Relevant Strategic Purpose**

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

Date: 9th March 2023

#### **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

6.1 Good governance along with risk management underpin all the Corporate strategic purposes. This report provides an independent assurance over certain aspects of the Council's operations.

#### **Climate Change Implications**

6.2 The actions proposed do not have a direct impact on climate change implications.

#### 7. OTHER IMPLICATIONS

#### **Equalities and Diversity Implications**

7.1 There are no implications arising out of this report.

#### **Operational Implications**

7.2 There are no new operational implications arising from this report.

#### 8. RISK MANAGEMENT

- 8.1 The main risks associated with the details included in this report are to:
  - Insufficiently complete the planned programme of audit work within the financial year leading to an inability to produce an annual opinion; and,
  - a continuous provision of an internal audit service is not maintained.

#### 9. APPENDICES and BACKGROUND PAPERS

Appendix 1 ~ 2022/23 Internal Audit Plan summary of delivery

Appendix 2 ~ 2022/23 Plan progress

Appendix 3 ~ 2022/23 Finalised audit reports including definitions.

Appendix 4 ~ Follow Up Programme Overview

Appendix 5 ~ Follow Up Reports

Date: 9th March 2023

#### **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

#### **APPENDIX 1**

#### <u>Delivery against Internal Audit Plan for 2022/23</u> 1st April 2022 to 31st January 2023

Audit Area	Revised 2022/23 Plan Days	Days used to 31 <sup>st</sup> January 2023	
Core Financial Systems (see note 1)	56	28	
Corporate Audits	37	19	
Other Systems Audits (see note 2)	61	41	
SUB TOTAL	154	88	
Audit Management Meetings/ Corporate Meetings / Reading/			
Annual Plans, Reports and Audit Committee Support	31	21	
Other chargeable (see note 3)	0	0	
SUB TOTAL	31	21	
TOTAL	185	109	

Audit days used are rounded to the nearest whole.

Note 1: Core Financial Systems are audited predominantly in quarters 3 and 4 to maximise the assurance provided for Annual Governance Statement and Statement of Accounts but not interfere with year-end. A rolling programme continues regarding Debtors, Creditors and Payroll to maximise coverage and sample size. The overall results will be reported during Q4.

Note 2: Several budgets in this section are 'on demand' (e.g. consultancy, investigations) so the requirements can fluctuate throughout the quarters potentially resulting in unallocated days.

Note 3: 'Other chargeable' days equate to times where there has been, for example, significant disruption to the IT provision resulting in lost productivity.

#### Date: 9th March 2023

## **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

#### **APPENDIX 2**

#### 2022/23 Internal Audit Plan

Audit Area	Corporate Link (Corporate Priority / Strategic Purpose)	Risk Register Reference	Indicative Date of Delivery 2022/23	Current Position	Estimated Resource 2022/23
FINANCIAL					
Debtors (note 1)	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q1 to Q4	Final Report issued 20 <sup>th</sup> February 2023	9*
Main Ledger/Budget Monitor/Bank Rec (note 1)	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q3 – Q4	Final Report issued 20 <sup>th</sup> February 2023	7*
Creditors (note 1)	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q1 to Q4	Rolling Programme /Testing in progress	14*
Treasury Management (incl. Asset & Acquisitions)	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q3	Testing in progress	6*
Council Tax	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q3 – Q4	Testing in progress	6*
Benefits	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q3 – Q4	Testing in progress	8*
NNDR	Enabling	Lack of robust financial accounting and monitoring arrangement	Q3 – Q4	Testing in progress	6*
Sub Total					56

# ²age 26

# Agenda Item

Date: 9th March 2023

## AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE

Audit Area	Corporate Link (Corporate Priority / Strategic Purpose)	Risk Register Reference	Indicative Date of Delivery 2022/23	Current Position	Estimated Resource 2022/23
CORPORATE					
IT Audit (Cyber essentials)	Fundamental to strategic purpose delivery	N/a	Q3 - Q4	Testing in Progress	10*
Risk Management (Action Plan implementation) (note 2)	Fundamental to strategic purpose delivery	S151	Q3 - Q4	Testing in Progress	10*
GIS & Gazetteer – Phase 1	Fundamental to strategic purpose delivery	HoS	Q1	Final Report issued 16/08/2022	10*
Transformational Team Utilisation	Fundamental to strategic purpose delivery	HoS	Q1 - Q2	Testing in Progress	7*
Disabled Facility Grants	Enabling	N/a	Q3	Liaison with County underway	0
Sub Total					37
SERVICE DELIVERY			· ·		
<b>Environmental &amp; Housing</b>	Property Services				
Workshop Licensing Compliance	Statutory and Regulatory Requirement	HoS	Q2	Draft Report issued 22 <sup>nd</sup> February 2023	11
Fuel Usage across the fleet (note 3)	Enabling	HoS	Q2	Final Report issued 28/10/2022	10
Planning, Regeneration &	Leisure				
Leisure Strategy	Help me run a successful business	HoS	Q3 - Q4	Rolled to 2023/24. Budget reallocated to offset some of the Fuel Usage review.	0

#### Date: 9th March 2023

## **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

Audit Area	Corporate Link (Corporate Priority / Strategic Purpose)	Risk Register Reference	Indicative Date of Delivery 2022/23	Current Position	Estimated Resource 2022/23
Worcester Regulatory Ser	vices				
	Statutory and Regulatory Requirement	HoS	Q2-Q3	Testing in Progress	12
Sub TOTAL					33
Other Operational Work					
Advisory, Consultancy & Contingency	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4	Ongoing	4
Fraud & Investigations incl. NFI	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4	Ongoing	4
Completion of prior year's audits	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4	Ongoing	8
Report Follow Up (all areas)	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4	Ongoing	8
Statement of Internal Control	Operational support	N/a	Q1 & Q4	Q1 completed	4*
Sub TOTAL					28
Audit Management Meetings	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4		
Corporate Meetings / Reading	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4	Ongoing	31
Annual Plans, Reports & Committee Support	Operational support	N/a	Q1 to Q4		
Sub TOTAL					31
TOTAL CHARGEABLE					185

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

Date: 9th March 2023

## **AUDIT, STANDARDS AND GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

#### **Explanatory Notes:**

\*As part of the increasing joint and shared service working between Bromsgrove District Council and Redditch Borough Council the audit budgets and areas will feature in the internal audit plans and be consolidated to deliver a single piece of work covering both Councils. Where practically possible the days will be split equally between the plans. Weighting will, however, be applied if it is considered the focus of the work will major on one Council.

The customer journey will be considered overall as part of the service audits.

- Note 1: New financial system therefore audit budget increase.
- Note 2: Risk management relaunch reviewing ongoing progress against action plan and reporting.
- Note 3: There was no budget included in the original plan for this additional piece of work.

# Page 29

# Agenda Item 7

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

## Audit, Governance & Standards Committee

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

**APPENDIX 3** 

Appendices A & B are indicated below and can be applied to all reports.

#### **Appendix A**

#### **Definition of Audit Opinion Levels of Assurance**

Opinion	Definition
Full Assurance	The system of internal control meets the organisation's objectives; all of the expected system controls tested are in place and are operating effectively.
	No specific follow up review will be undertaken; follow up will be undertaken as part of the next planned review of the system.
Significant Assurance	There is a generally sound system of internal control in place designed to meet the organisation's objectives. However isolated weaknesses in the design of controls or inconsistent application of controls in a small number of areas put the achievement of a limited number of system objectives at risk.
	Follow up of medium priority recommendations only will be undertaken after 6 months; follow up of low priority recommendations will be undertaken as par of the next planned review of the system.
Moderate Assurance	The system of control is generally sound however some of the expected controls are not in place and / or are not operating effectively therefore increasing the risk that the system will not meet its objectives. Assurance can only be given over the effectiveness of controls within some areas of the system.
	Follow up of high and medium priority recommendations only will be undertaken after 6 months; follow up of low priority recommendations will be undertaken as part of the next planned review of the system.
Limited Assurance	Weaknesses in the design and / or inconsistent application of controls put the achievement of the organisation's objectives at risk in many of the area reviewed. Assurance is limited to the few areas of the system where controls are in place and are operating effectively.
	Follow up of high and medium priority recommendations only will be undertaken after 6 months; follow up of low priority recommendations will be undertaken as part of the next planned review of the system.
No Assurance	No assurance can be given on the system of internal control as significant weaknesses in the design and / or operation of key controls could result or have resulted in failure to achieve the organisation's objectives in the area reviewed.
	Follow up of high and medium priority recommendations only will be undertaken after 6 months; follow up of low priority recommendations will be undertaken as part of the next planned review of the system.

## Audit, Governance & Standards Committee 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

# Appendix B Definition of Priority of Recommendations

Priority	Definition						
High	Control weakness that has or is likely to have a significant impact upon the achievement of key system, function or process objectives.						
	Immediate implementation of the agreed recommendation is essential in order to provide satisfactory control of the serious risk(s) the system is exposed to.						
Medium	Control weakness that has or is likely to have a medium impact upon the achievement of key system, function or process objectives.						
	Implementation of the agreed recommendation within 3 to 6 months is important in order to provide satisfactory control of the risk(s) the system is exposed to.						
Low	Control weakness that has a low impact upon the achievement of key system, function or process objectives.						
	Implementation of the agreed recommendation is desirable as it will improve overall control within the system.						

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

## **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

#### 2022/23 Audit Report.

Finalised report since the last Committee sitting.

### **Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service**





## **Final Internal Audit Report**

**Accounts Receivable 2022/23** 

20<sup>th</sup> February 2023

#### Distribution:

To: Head of Finance and Customer Services

CC: Section 151 Officer

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

## **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

#### Contents

1.	Introduction	14
2	Background	14
	Audit Opinion and Executive Summary	
	Overall conclusion	
5. I	ndependence and Ethics:	16
ΑP	PENDIX A	ıed

#### 1. Introduction

1.1 The audit of Accounts Receivable system was included in the Internal Audit Shared Service Audit Plan for Redditch Borough Council for 2022/23 as approved by the Audit, Governance and Standards Committee on 28<sup>th</sup> July 2022 and for Bromsgrove District Council as approved by the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee on 21<sup>st</sup> July 2022.

#### 2 Background

2.1 In 2021/22 Internal Audit carried out a full review of the Accounts Receivable module. The review provided an assurance level of limited as although invoices and credit notes were being raised and the system does provide a good audit trail of transactions there were some issues

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

### Audit, Governance & Standards Committee 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

around old balances brought forward and the clearing of the debtor's suspense account due to an issue with the cash receipting system. This meant that the accuracy of debtors' accounts could not be verified so some but not all debt collection had been suspended.

- 2.2 There was also a finding around systems access in relation to 2 factor authentication. Internal audit can now report that this recommendation has been implemented and no further action is required.
- 2.3 In the last year there has been a change in the Director of Resources and the Head of Finance and Customer Services. However, the now S151 Officer was the previous Interim Head of Finance and Customer Services and had identified the issues with the system and had created an action plan to address this. Unfortunately, recruitment of staff has meant that the plan was delayed.

#### 3 Audit Opinion and Executive Summary

- 3.1 Since the review was undertake last year there has been a positive direction of travel. The Council has a full understanding of systems issues and worked with the system provider to provide an update to fix this issue.
- 3.2 The update to the system has been made and was rolled into the live system in November 2022.
- 3.3 Now the system has been updated, there will need to be a period of making sure that the data is as accurate as can be and Debtors account balances are correctly stated. Therefore, a tidying up exercise and a reconciliation with the General ledger will be required. It is hoped that by April 2023 the system will be working as intended.
- 3.4 Debt Management procedures can then be undertaken in full.
- 3.5 Training on the system in order to use its full functionality was also recommended in the previous review. There is a plan for the service to develop a series of training for officers to understand why they need to process things in a certain way and help staff understand the impact of failing to do things. This is hoped to be achieved from April 2023.

# Page 34

# Agenda Item 7

#### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

### Audit, Governance & Standards Committee 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

#### 4 Overall conclusion

Good progress has been made as after testing had taken place on an update to the system to ensure that this had resolved the issue in November 2022 the update was implemented on the live system. This is now working and therefore from that point onwards the information within the Accounts Receivable module will be correct.

Internal Audit can report that the Council are raising invoices and chasing debt where practical. A reconciliation with the General Ledger will be required in order to ensure that the two systems are showing the same Debtors Balance. These reconciliations will be undertaken in phases in line with the production of the Statement of Accounts. The outstanding 2020/21 Statement of Accounts have been produced the next phase will be the production of the 2021/22 Statement of Accounts. Therefore, there is still work to be undertaken before a full Debt Management process can be implemented.

Although good progress is being made the Limited Assurance from the previous review remains as there is still work to be undertaken to ensure the accuracy of the data held within the Accounts receivable module.

#### 5. Independence and Ethics:

- WIASS confirms that in relation to this review there were no significant facts or matters that impacted on our independence as Internal Auditors that we are required to report.
- WIASS conforms with the Institute of Internal Auditors Public Sector Internal Audit Standards as amended and confirms that we are independent and able to express an objective opinion in relation to this review.
- WIASS confirm that policies and procedures have been implemented to meet the IIA Ethical Standards.
- Prior to and at the time of the audit no non-audit or audit related services have been undertaken for the Council within this area of review.

#### **Head of Internal Audit Shared Services**

### **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

## **Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service**





**Final Internal Audit Report** 

**General Ledger 2022/23** 

Date 20th February 2023

#### Distribution:

To: Head of Finance and Customer Service

Section 151 Officer

### **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

#### Contents

1.	Introduction	14
2	Background	14
	Audit Opinion and Executive Summary	
	Overall conclusion	
5. l	ndependence and Ethics:	16
	PENDIX A Error! Bookmark not defin	

#### 1. Introduction

1.2 The audit of the General Ledger was included in the Internal Audit Shared Service Audit Plan for Redditch Borough Council for 2022/23 as approved by the Audit, Governance and Standards Committee on 28<sup>th</sup> July 2022 and for Bromsgrove District Council as approved by the Audit, Standards and Governance Committee on 21<sup>st</sup> July 2022.

#### 2 Background

2.1 In February 2020 the Council transferred to a new finance system. Since that date there have been several issues with the set up of the system and its functionality.

# Agenda Item 7

### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

### Audit, Governance & Standards Committee

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

- 2.2 In addition to this an additional pressure came when officers that had been allocated administration status and had the knowledge on how the system worked left the Council for new employment. The difficulties faced in recruitment to the vacant posts meant that resources within the Finance Section were scare and it was necessary to concentrate on the areas that were the greatest risk to the council.
- 2.3 In the last year there has also been a change in the Director of Resources and the Head of Finance and Customer Services.
- 2.4 In the previous financial year the then interim Head of Finance and Customer Services devised an action plan to address the issues and the risks posed from the problems encountered with the finance system and the resources within the Finance team.
- 2.5 Although there was an initial difficulty in recruitment of staff this has now been resolved and the majority of posts have been filled.
- 2.6 In relation to the system there were known issues with the system which meant that reconciliations could not be undertaken, budget monitoring was not taking place and the Councils were behind with the preparation of the Statement of Accounts.
- 2.7 It should be noted that the Finance Team did to their credit, produce a 2022/23 budget that was presented to Members.
- 2.8 Because of this there was no point in Internal Audit carrying out a review of the system as no assurance could be gained that the data was accurately recorded, the review would also have only told the Council what they already knew and therefore a statement was presented to Members informing them of the situation and the risks this posed.

### 3 Audit Opinion and Executive Summary

- 3.1 We are again unable to give any assurance over the controls within this area or the accuracy of the data held within the main ledger. Although it should be noted that a lot of work has been undertaken to address the issues identified and whereas no Budget monitoring had taken place this year there has been some.
- 3.2 The main issue was the cash receipting module which was not recognising the correct entity to post the receipts to as the system has been set up as one ledger rather than three individual ledgers. This has resulted in incorrect, multiple and duplicate cash posting meaning that

# Agenda Item 7

### **BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL**

### **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

reconciliations could not be undertaken, suspense accounts could not be cleared, and the Statement of Accounts could not be completed until the module had been fixed. In November 2022 after testing had taken place the system was updated to fix the problems with the cash receipting module. This has meant that whereas previously an abnormal number of transactions were being sent to the suspense account this has now reduced to what could be expected of a fully functioning system.

- 3.3 The General Ledger module is currently being driven by the Finance team. Once Finance are satisfied the issues have been fully resolved and the data held within is accurate training will be provided and then the module will be rolled out to the services to undertake their own budget monitoring.
- 3.4 Even though the Finance team have been facing these issues budget monitoring for both Redditch Borough Council and Bromsgrove District Council has taken place.

### 4 Overall conclusion

The system issues have now been fully identified and the Council have worked with the provider to resolve the issues which were mainly based around the cash receipting module. At the initial stage of this review the Finance Team which are now adequately resourced were in the testing stage but have since implemented the update into the live system and are now concentrating on the completion of the remaining outstanding Statement of Accounts. This is a big step forward from where the Council were at the beginning of the year with no fix in place for the system issues and a lack of resource.

If the timetable to complete all outstanding Statement of Accounts is achieved then the Council will be in a good position for the beginning of the 2023/24 Financial Year.

There is no point at this current time carrying out a full review as issues/risks are already known to the Service and are being monitored by the Head of Finance and Customer Services on a daily basis. The Head of Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service and the Head of Finance and Customer Services are meeting on a monthly basis to discuss progress and the risks still faced by the Councils.

As at this time there is still a risk posed to the Councils Internal Audit will bring forward the 2023/24 review to the 2<sup>nd</sup> Quarter to allow time for the Statement of Accounts to all be brought up to date and for reconciliations to be completed and suspense accounts to be cleared.

# Audit, Governance & Standards Committee 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

### 5. Independence and Ethics:

- WIASS confirms that in relation to this review there were no significant facts or matters that impacted on our independence as Internal Auditors that we are required to report.
- WIASS conforms with the Institute of Internal Auditors Public Sector Internal Audit Standards as amended and confirms that we are independent and able to express an objective opinion in relation to this review.
- WIASS confirm that policies and procedures have been implemented to meet the IIA Ethical Standards.
- Prior to and at the time of the audit no non-audit or audit related services have been undertaken for the Council within this area of review.

### **Head of Internal Audit Shared Services**

# **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

### **Appendix 4 – Overview of Follow Up Programme**

	Year of Review	Review Area	Assurance	Follow Up Position	Indicative Da Follow U		Conclusion
BDC	20/21	Orb	Moderate	Completed			No further action required
BDC	20/21	Use of Agency and Consultancy	Critical review	Completed			No further action required
BDC	21/22	Strategic Acquisitions	Significant	Completed			No further action required
BDC	21/22	Accounts Payable	Moderate	Completed			No further action required
BDC	21/22	Projects	Moderate	Completed			No further action required
BDC	21/22	Budget Monitoring	Critical review	Completed			No further action required
BDC	21/22	Fuel Usage	Critical review	Completed			No further action required
BDC	21/22	Grants	Significant	1st	Jan-23	Q4	Awaiting sign off
BDC	21/22	Procurement	Limited	1st	Jul-23	Q2	Update report provided Jan 23
BDC	21/22	General Data Protection Regulation	Moderate	2nd	Jul-23	Q2	1 recommendation implemented and 2 partially implemented. Further follow up required.

# Agenda Item 7

### BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

# **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

	Year of Review	Review Area	Assurance	Follow Up Position	Indicative Dat Follow Up		Conclusion
BDC	21/22	Treasury Management	Significant	1st	Dec-22	Q3	Included in 22/23 Audit
BDC	21/22	Accounts Receivable	Limited	1st	Dec-22	Q3	Included in 22/23 Audit
BDC	21/22	Council Tax	Significant	1st	Nov-22	Q3	Included in 22/23 Audit
BDC	21/22	National Non- Domestic Rates	Significant	1st	Nov-22	Q3	Included in 22/23 Audit
BDC	21/22	Risk Management	No	1st	Nov-22	Q3	Included in 22/23 Audit
BDC	21/22	Benefits	Significant	1st	Nov-22	Q3	Included in 22/23 Audit

Note: 2022/23 Review areas will be added to the table when them become due for a follow up visit.

## **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

Appendix 5 – Follow Up Reports

### **Worcestershire Internal Audit Shared Service**



**GDPR-Document Retention 2021/22** 

1st Follow-up Report - 13th January 2023

### **Distribution:**

To: Head of Transformation

ICT Transformation Manager ICT Operations Manager

Cc: Chief Executive

## **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

### **Contents**

Section A - Justification of Audit Follow-up Approach
Section B – Conclusion
Section C – Current Postion
APPENDIX A6
APPENDIX B

### Section A - Justification of Audit Follow-up Approach

The date of the final audit report was 05/11/2021 and is being followed up because:

1 'high' and 2 'medium' priority recommendations were made.

The following audit approach has therefore been applied:

- The 1 'high' and 2 'medium' priority recommendations have been updated with the current position. (Please see Section C)
- Where required recommendations against weaknesses in key controls have been tested and evidenced.

# Agenda Item

### BROMSGROVE DISTRICT COUNCIL

## Audit, Governance & Standards Committee 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

### Section B - Conclusion - Current Position statement

The original audit report gave **Moderate Assurance** over the control environment, and this is the 1<sup>st</sup> follow-up.

Out of the 1 'high' and 2 'medium' priority recommendations 1 'medium' priority recommendation in relation to the Asset Information and Retention of Electronic Data has been implemented.

The high priority recommendation in relation to Two Factor Authentication and the medium priority recommendation in relation to printing from home have been partially implemented and the risk to the Council has been reduced. However more work is required to fully implement these recommendations to further mitigate potential risk.

From the explanations received and evidence provided, internal audit is satisfied that with the change of direction made since the review was undertaken, that good progress has been made to reduce the risk to the authority. As some of the actions have not been fully implemented there will be a further follow up required in the next 6 months to check that the progress of the remaining actions have been fully implemented.

This follow up was undertaken during the month of January 2023.

# Audit, Governance & Standards Committee

9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

### **Section C – Current Position**

Ref./	Recommendation	Management Response and Action Plan	1st Follow up
Priority			Position at 11 <sup>th</sup> January 2023
1 High	Two factor authentications	Responsible Manager: ICT Manager	Partially Implemented
	To review if the security protocols currently in place on the network and on cloud-based systems is secure enough especially those that only have single factor authentication.	Implementation date: December 2021	Since the review was undertaken there has been a positive direction of travel in the level of security that IT are implementing to protect Council data.
		It is accepted that there is a risk around the two-factor authentication and the authority is aware of the current risks around 3 <sup>rd</sup> party users.	A two step authentication has been put in place to gain system access and some systems require two step authentications to be able to use cloud based systems such as Shared Point.
		This is currently in progress as ICT are working through a list of all 3 <sup>rd</sup> party users and looking to move these to a two-factor authentication when accessing the network.	There are still further actions to take place on other cloud-based systems which will be implemented by spring 2023.
		Some mitigation is being put in place for the 3 <sup>rd</sup> parties by doing a posture check on all devices to ensure they are who they say they are.	
		In relation to Tech one – ICT are working with the tech team at Tech one and are working to resolve the issue.	
2 Medium	Asset Information Register and Retention of Electronic Data		
	As a new Information asset register is being developed, there needs to be a process in place that clearly allocates responsibilities to ensure the document is kept up to date	Responsible Manager: ICT Manager and Head of Transformation & Organisational Development	Implemented  The Information Support Team have been working to securely destroy information that has surpassed the
	and that data is being destroyed in an	Implementation date:	data retention period.

>
<u> </u>
<u>ک</u> د
3

Ref./ Priority	Recommendation	Management Response and Action Plan	1st Follow up Position at 11th January 2023
	appropriate and timely manner in case of challenge by the ISO.  For examples a sign off sheet is completed by service areas annually.  Clarity needs to be provided to service areas as part of the plans of the new system, as to what the corporate expectation is for updating records and ensuring all data is cleansed as required.	There is a campaign currently in place with the comms team to help with destroying information once it has surpassed the data retention period.  Both authorities are working to conduct an Interactive approach to help staff change their behaviour when it comes to the cleansing of data and keeping the asset register and retention schedule up to date.  Currently if an issue is found, it gets reported to the ICT manager on a weekly basis, which would then be escalated by the ICT Manager to the Head of Service of the service area.  Accept the risk that there is no current sanctions if this continues after talking to the Head of Service, so proposing taking the escalation further to CMT for sanctions to take place.	This will be an on-going process as data will continue to reach its data retention date and therefore require disposal.,  However, there is a robust control in place through the Information Management weekly meetings with an agenda that features reviewing Physical records including those that have been archived at Bromsgrove and Redditch.  Although the Information Management Team attend the meeting weekly other attending officers will vary and is dependent on what's on the agenda.
3 Medium	Printing from home policy and Docmail  If printing from home is not going to be allowed, then this needs to be clearly communicated to all staff and a review undertaken outside of the network on work devices, to ensure that appropriate controls are in place to disable printers such as Bluetooth/USB/WIFI from being added to the laptop.	Responsible Manager: ICT Manager and Head of Transformation & Organisational Development  Implementation date: March 2022  Currently there is an agile working policy in draft which is going to CMT for approval. This policy will include information in relation to not printing from home and will encourage more electronic data rather than hard copy.	Partially Implemented  The draft agile policy went to the Corporate Management Team the outcome of which was that a project plan would take place, where discussions would take place with each of the services in the Authority to agree how the Authority will proceed in the future. This plan will be implemented by the end of 2023.  An IT permissions policy has been implemented to prevent users from adding/removing printers.

# **Audit, Governance & Standards Committee**

## 9<sup>th</sup> March 2023

Ref./ Priority	<u>Recommendation</u>	Management Response and Action Plan	1st Follow up Position at 11th January 2023
	To review the current ICT security policy and decide if printing from home needs to be included within the policy, so that if caught sanctions can be provided, especially if the authority is moving towards a more agile way of working.	Investigations by ICT to take place to check if administration rights are enabled for staff to add printers when working from home. If so, will remove admin rights to do this and add appropriate measures to reduce the risk.	
	To review the Docmail system and decide if additional procedures and policies need to be developed to either permit staff to be able to use the Docmail freely or if sanctions need to be introduced against staff as a deterrent from sending information to their homes which could ultimately lead to either a data breach or financial cost to the council.	In relation to Docmail – The Head of Transformation & Organisational Development will speak with the Personal Assistant responsible for the Docmail system to assess the measures that can be put in place to monitor and reduce the risk.	

This page is intentionally left blank

### **AUDIT, STANDARDS & GOVERNANCE COMMITTEE**

### **WORK PROGRAMME 2022/23**

### 9th March 2023

- Audit Task Group Final Report (for the Root and Branch Review on how the Council arrived at the Section 24 Notice)
- Standards Regime Monitoring Officer's Report
- Audit, Standards and Governance Committee Annual Report 2022 -2023
- Grant Thornton Audit Plan 2023-2024\*
- Internal Audit Draft Audit Plan\*
- Internal Audit Progress report
- Statement of Accounts 2021/2022 Verbal Update
- Risk Champion's Verbal Update Cllr M. Middleton
- Audit, Standards and Governance Committee Work Programme

\*postponed

